

## **Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Myanmar National REDD+ Taskforce**

Date: 19 September 2018

Venue: Forest Department

Time: 10:30 – 13:00

Objective of the meeting: To update the Taskforce on progress in REDD+ initiatives in Myanmar, and to discuss the way forward for the Taskforce

Chair: U Kyaw Kyaw Lwin, Deputy Director General, Forest Department

Participants:

Taskforce members Daw Aye Aye Thin, Assistant Director, Planning Department, MOPF,  
U Kyaw Lwin, Director, Department of Planning, MOALI,  
Dr. Mu Mu Than, Deputy Director, IWUMD  
U Kyaw San Naing, Director, ECD  
Daw Naw Wai Mar Oo, Director, Budget Department, MOPF  
U Kyaw Soe, Assistant Director, General Administered Department,  
U Than Soe Oo, MERN,  
Daw Naw Ei Ei Min, Director, POINT  
Daw Khine Zar Win, Manager, CSR Department, KBZ Bank

Taskforce Secretary Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, Director, Forest Research Institute (FRI), Forest Department, National Programme Director, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar

Observers/Donors Dr. Yuya Aye, Assistant Director, FRI, Mr. Franz Arnold, Chief Technical Advisor, FAO Myanmar, Daw Thinn Thitsar Kyaw, Project Assistant, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar, Mr. Timothy Boyle, Chief Technical Advisor, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar, Daw Khin Hnin Myint, Programme Coordinator, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar, U Min Soe, Stakeholder Engagement Officer, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar, Daw Phyo Pa Pa Han, REDD+ Office Assistant, REDD+ National Programme, Myanmar.

### **Agenda item 1: Opening**

The meeting was opened by U Kyaw Kyaw Lwin, Chair of the TF, Deputy Director General of the Forest Department.

### **Agenda item 2: Action taken to follow up on Decisions reached at the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Taskforce**

Dr. Thaug Naing Oo, Secretary of the TF reported on the implementation of decisions reached at the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the TF. Progress can be seen in the table below.

<b>No.</b>	<b>Decision</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>
4/1	The Taskforce defers making a decision on approval of Phase 3 documents (BUR Technical Annex and SOI) until Myanmar is in Phase 3.	No action required
4/2	The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to obtain clarification as to whether the NECCCCC (and its Working Groups) have the authority to approve documents.	<p>The Secretary has established that the NECCCCC does not have the authority to approve REDD+ documents as it is governed by the ECD law. Relevant documents need to be approved by Union Cabinet, but before submission, such documents should be presented to, and receive support/feedback from the NECCCCC. Documents should be submitted to the Union Cabinet by Union Minister through DG FD.</p> <p>With the approval of Union Minister, Permanent Secretary or DG ECD will make presentations about such documents at NECCCCC Meetings for their support/comments.</p>
4/3	The Taskforce approves the proposal of the REDD+ Office regarding approval of Phase 1 documents, subject to clarification under Decision 4/2.	On the basis of objections from some observers to the Taskforce, agenda item 3 of the 5 <sup>th</sup> meeting of the Taskforce includes a review of this Decision (see Document TF5/3)
4/4	The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to further develop the database of REDD+ related projects by adding information on achievements of each project.	The database has been further developed as instructed, and is presented as Document 5/8
4/5	The Taskforce instructs the Secretary to prepare a briefing on the role of women in REDD+ in Myanmar, for presentation to the 5 <sup>th</sup> meeting of the Taskforce.	An item on the role of women in REDD+ in Myanmar is included in the agenda of the 5 <sup>th</sup> meeting of the Taskforce, and information is provided in Document 5/5
4/6	The Taskforce requested that a further agenda item on engagement in multiple forest carbon mechanisms be included at its 5 <sup>th</sup> meeting	An item on engagement in multiple forest carbon mechanisms is included in the agenda of the 5 <sup>th</sup> meeting of the Taskforce, and information is provided in Document 5/6
4/7	The Taskforce agreed that the GoM should insist that an analysis clarifying costs, revenues, risks and benefits should be conducted by the party proposing the non-REDD+ mechanism before any	No action required at this time

	agreement is signed, so as to allow the GoM to take an informed decision.	
--	---	--

Further information on follow-up to Decision 4/3 was provided in a separate agenda item (see agenda item 3, below). The action on decision 4/5: the role of women in REDD+ and decision 4/6: engagement in multiple forest carbon mechanisms, were presented as below agenda item 6 and 8 respectively.

**Agenda item 3: The proposal of the REDD+ Office regarding approval of Phase 1 documents**

Daw Khin Hnin Myint, Programme Coordinator of the UN-REDD Programme briefly presented the decision 4/3: the approval of phase 1 documents, and the comments of the observers of the TF to review and re-check the mandate of the taskforce.

Discussion

National REDD+ Strategy will be submitted to Union Cabinet for approval, the FRL and NFMS will have approval of Minister of MONREC and the SIS system will be submitted to the relevant ministries for securing comments from relevant Ministries and approval. The need for approval by Union Cabinet is subject to Minister’s Decision.

TF members expressed concern on the amount of time required to submit documents to the UNFCCC. The Chair commented that DG of FD or ECD will has been requested to play role in this process.

Decision:

Decision TF5/1: Decision TF4/3 was amended as per the table below.

Document	Approval process (decision at 4 <sup>th</sup> meeting)	Approval Process (amendment by 5 <sup>th</sup> meeting)
National REDD+ Strategy [and Investment Plan]	TF endorses and refers to NECCCC for approval	TF endorses and refers to Union Cabinet for approval. It should be submitted to the NECCCC for comment before being submitted to the Union Cabinet
Forest Reference Level (or Forest Emissions Reference Level)	TF endorses and refers to Minister of MONREC for approval	Remains unchanged
Design of the National Forest Monitoring system	TF approves	TF endorses and refers to Minister of MONREC for approval
Design of the Safeguard Information System	TF approves	TF endorses and refers to the relevant Minister for approval. Minister will

secure comments from relevant ministries before approval.

#### **Agenda item 4: Progress on REDD+ in Myanmar**

Dr. Thaug Naing Oo described the progress on REDD+ in Myanmar in the context of the Warsaw Framework for REDD+. The consultation process on REDD+ strategy is continuously conducted. The focus is engagement with ethnic nationalities. It has been completed for Danu, Mon and Pa-O and is on-going for 10 other ethnic nationalities. The process of responding to the Technical Assessment (TA) of the FREL submission is on-going. The formal assessment document of the proposed FRL has not yet been received. Whether or not further response from Myanmar side is necessary will be decided upon reception and analysis of the formal TA report (probably early September). The major focus for work on the NFMS over the past 3 months has been on planning issues of the NFI with further internal discussions of different sample size options and the field methodology. As a result of several meetings held over the past 3 months, a draft national clarification of the Cancun safeguards has been produced and is undergoing on public consultation. The analysis of the policy and legal framework has been completed and recommendations for improvement produced. A process to explore the possibility of Norwegian funding to support implementation of the National REDD+ Strategy in southern Myanmar has been initiated.

#### Discussion

The current engagement plan doesn't include Rakhine, the Chair suggested that this group should be consulted as well. The UN-REDD PMU informed the TF that a sub-national consultation has already been done in Sittwe at the beginning of 2018, and since there is no self-administered area or EAO holding significant territory in Rakhine, an additional process for the Rakhine is not considered essential.

The participants had discussion on consultation with indigenous people/ethnic nationality and engagement in REDD+ process. In term of Safeguards, the FPIC process need to be enforced in the formation of PEF process. The Chair informed about new Forest Law which highlights the involvement of ethnic nationalities/Community's representative in the committee of accept and solve the claims of the communities. But the detailed process on FPIC doesn't included in the Law and it need to be involve in Rule. TF instructed UN-REDD to do support for the enforcement of FPIC for the formulation of PEF.

The Chair highlighted the new Conservation of Biodiversity and Protect Areas law which recognizes the community managed protect areas and mangrove forests. The forest cover can be considered those community managed areas which can supplement the target of forest cover set under NDC. There has discussion about data based on Community Forests whether FD's data based on Community Forest (CF) includes KNU managed CF areas or not and the Chair response was currently FD cannot include such areas due to the unavailability of data from KNU.

## Decisions

Decision TF5/2: The Taskforce requested UN-REDD to support the formulation of FPIC principle and enforcement on FPIC for the formulation of PFE.

### **Agenda item 6: The role of women in REDD+ in Myanmar**

Mr. Timothy Boyle, CTA, UN-REDD/Myanmar, gave initial briefing on Promoting Women's Active Involvement in REDD+ in Myanmar. He highlighted how women's active role in REDD+ can be supported at the National Level REDD+ implementation. He highlighted the following consideration points for TF to make decision on gender issue on REDD+:

- Institutional arrangements relating to Taskforce & TWG's
- Training for Taskforce and TWG members
- Inclusion of a gender perspective in the competency framework
- Development of tools, such as a checklist for women's participation & gender mainstreaming
- Development of a more in-depth gender and REDD+ analysis & gender action plan

## Decisions

Decision TF5/3: TF instructed TF secretary to invite a representative of Social Welfare Department under MSWRR to be the TF member.

Decision TF5/4: TF recommended that integrate a gender approach within competency framework & existing training plans rather than developing stand-alone training.

### **Agenda item 8: Further information on the issues that need to be considered in the negotiation of any bilateral initiatives related to emission reductions from forests**

Mr. Timothy Boyle, CTA, UN-REDD/Myanmar, shared the information on the issues relating to negotiation of any bilateral initiatives related to emission reductions from forests. He shared the summary of information presented to the Taskforce at its 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> meetings by highlighting the following key points:

- a) The default assumption if engaging in multiple forest carbon mechanisms should be that total revenues from emission reductions will not differ from those under a REDD+ only scenario. Revenues would only increase if the unit price paid under non-REDD+ mechanisms were higher (or the discounts/buffers smaller).
- b) Costs of engaging in multiple forest carbon mechanisms would certainly be higher. The magnitude of the additional costs depends on the extent to which the methodologies (carbon accounting and scale of intervention) differ from REDD+

- c) Therefore, net financial returns under a mixed scenario are likely to be lower than under REDD+ only, unless unit prices are significantly higher.
- d) Engaging in bilateral mechanisms under which both parties are also Parties to the UNFCCC, and which involve a transfer of title, would make it harder for Myanmar to meet its NDC targets.
- e) Voluntary market projects not involving the GoM as a party would be exempt from many of the issues described above but would involve additional complexities related to carbon rights.

### **Agenda item 10: The status of development of the National REDD+ Strategy**

Dr. Thaung Naing Oo updated on the status of REDD+ Strategy Development. He mentioned the content of draft national strategy and the sources referring to the development of the draft. The contents of strategies derived from numerous sources: REDD+ Readiness Roadmap, Inputs from TWG/Drivers and Strategy, Analyses conducted under the UN-REDD programme, Stakeholder Engagement Guidelines and a Communications and Knowledge Management Strategy Developed by the UN-REDD, Expert inputs through focus discussion groups, inputs by the UN-REDD CTAs. He highlighted the consultation process as well. The following consultation process has been done so far.

- a) With Ministries and other government Agencies (June-July 2017)
- b) Sub-national (state/region) consultations (November 2017 – April 2018)
- c) Public consultation (April-May 2018)
- d) Ethnic Nationalities, including signatories of the National Ceasefire Agreement (May 2018 – on-going [completion anticipated end-2018])

He shared the status of each engage process in terms of the steps as well. As future developments, as the current draft is being used for consultations with Ethnic Nationalities and will be posted again on the REDD+ Myanmar web-site – not for formal public input but, in the interests of transparency, to be available to any interested stakeholder. Following completion of the consultations with the Ethnic Nationalities, the current draft will be revised to incorporate inputs from those consultations, as well as any feedback from Taskforce members and additional *ad hoc* comments submitted by other stakeholders. This revised draft will be submitted, through the Taskforce, to the NECCCCC, and based on their feedback – and with their support – submitted by the Union Minister of MONREC to the Union Cabinet for approved.

### Decisions

Decision TF5/5: The Chair instructed the secretary to review the members list of TF as some TF members have already been promoted to Deputy Director General and to send request to respective departments for replacement.

### **Summary of Decisions and Action points**

**Decision: 5/1:** National REDD+ Strategies will be submitted to Union Cabinet for approval, the FRL and NFMS will have approval of Minister of MONREC and the SIS system will be submitted to Minister of MONREC for taking comments from relevant Ministries and approval. Taking approval of Union Cabinet is subject to Minister's Decision.

**Decision 5/2:** The Taskforce requested UN-REDD to support the formulation of FPIC principle and enforcement on FPIC for the formulation of PFE.

**Decision: 5/3:** TF instructed TF secretary to invite a representative of Social Welfare Department under MSWRR to be member of the TF.

**Decision 5/4:** TF recommended that integrate a gender approach within competency framework & existing training plans rather than developing stand-alone training.

**Decision 5/5:** The Chair instructed the secretary to review the members list of TF as some TF members have already been promoted to Deputy Director General and to send request to respective departments for replacement.

### **Next meeting**

The next Taskforce meeting will be scheduled in December 2018.

### **Attachments**

- Agenda of the meeting
- Attendance list

Minutes approved by



Kyaw Kyaw Lwin  
Chair of National REDD+ Task Force  
Deputy Director General, Forest Department

## 5<sup>th</sup> Meeting of Myanmar REDD+ Task Force

### Annex 1: Agenda

No.	Time	Items	Facilitation
1	10:30 - 10:40	Opening remarks	Chair: U Kyaw Kyaw Lwin, Deputy Director General, Forest Department
2	10:40 – 10:55	Action taken to follow up on Decisions reached at the 4 <sup>th</sup> meeting of the Taskforce (Document TF5/2)	Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, Secretary to the Task Force
3	10:55 – 11:05	Review of Decision 4/3: Some observers to the Taskforce have commented that Decision 4/3 exceeds the mandate of the Taskforce (Document TF5/3)	Daw Khin Hnin Myint, UN-REDD Programme Coordinator
4	11:05 – 11:20	Progress on REDD+ in Myanmar and under the UN-REDD Programme in Myanmar (Document TF 5/4)	Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, National Programme Director, UN-REDD Programme, Secretary to the Task Force
5	11:20 – 12:30	Questions & Answers	Chair
6	11:30 – 11:45	The role of women in REDD+ in Myanmar (Document TF 5/5)	Timothy Boyle, CTA, UN-REDD Programme, Myanmar
7	11:45 – 11:55	Questions & Answers	Chair
8	11: 55 – 12:15	Further information on the issues that need to be taken into account in the negotiation of any bilateral initiatives related to emission reductions from forests (responding to Decision 3 from the 3 <sup>rd</sup> meeting of the TF) (Document TF 5/6)	Mr. Timothy Boyle, CTA, UN- REDD Programme, Myanmar
9	12:15 – 12:30	Questions & Answers	Chair
10	12:30 – 12:40	The status of development of the National REDD+ Strategy (Document TF 5/7)	Dr. Thaung Naing Oo, Secretary to the Task Force
11	12:40 – 12:55	Questions & Answers	Chair
12	12:55 – 13:00	Closing remarks	Chair: U Kyaw Kyaw Lwin, Deputy Director General, Forest Department
13	13:00	Lunch	



### 5<sup>th</sup> Meeting of Myanmar REDD+ Task Force

#### Annex 2: Attendance

No.	Name	Title	Organization	Email
1	Naw Ei Ei Min	Director	POINT	<a href="mailto:point.neem@gmail.com">point.neem@gmail.com</a>
2	Khine Zar Win	Manager	KBZ (Cooperate Affairs)	<a href="mailto:khine.zar.win@kbzbank.com">khine.zar.win@kbzbank.com</a>
3	Than Soe Oo	Programme Manager	MERN	<a href="mailto:thansoeoo2011@gmail.com">thansoeoo2011@gmail.com</a>
4	U Kyaw Soe	Assistant Director	GAD(MOHA)	<a href="mailto:landgad300@gmail.com">landgad300@gmail.com</a>
5	Mr. Franz Arnold	CTA	FAO	<a href="mailto:franz.arnold@fao.org">franz.arnold@fao.org</a>
6	Thinn Thitsar Kyaw	Project Assistant	FAO	<a href="mailto:Thinn.kyaw@fao.org">Thinn.kyaw@fao.org</a>
7	Dr. Mu Mu Than	Deputy Director	IWUMD	<a href="mailto:mt8190@gmail.com">mt8190@gmail.com</a>
8	Daw Aye Aye Thinn	Assistant Director	Planning Dept	<a href="mailto:thinayeaye1965@gmail.com">thinayeaye1965@gmail.com</a>
9	U Kyaw Kyaw Lwin	Director	Agricultural Planning	
10	Dr. Yu Ya Aye	Assistant Director	FRI, FD	<a href="mailto:yuyaaye@gmail.com">yuyaaye@gmail.com</a>
11	U Kyaw San Naing	Director	ECD	<a href="mailto:kyawsannaing.env@gmail.com">kyawsannaing.env@gmail.com</a>
12	Daw Naw Wai Mar Oo	Director	Budget Dept, MOPF	<a href="mailto:nawwilmaroo@gmail.com">nawwilmaroo@gmail.com</a>
13	Dr. Thaug Naing Oo	Director	FRI,FD	<a href="mailto:tnoo71@gmail.com">tnoo71@gmail.com</a>
14	Mr. Timothy Boyle	CTA	UN-REDD	<a href="mailto:timothy.boyle@undp.org">timothy.boyle@undp.org</a>
15	Daw Khin Hnin Myint	National Programme Coordinator	UN-REDD	<a href="mailto:khin.hnin.myint@undp.org">khin.hnin.myint@undp.org</a>
16	U Min Soe	SE officer	UN-REDD	<a href="mailto:min.soe@undp.org">min.soe@undp.org</a>
17	Phyo Pa Pa Han	Programme Assistant	UN-REDD	<a href="mailto:phyo.pa.pa.han@undp.org">phyo.pa.pa.han@undp.org</a>